EVALUATION OF FUNGICIDES AND BIOPESTICIDES FOR THE CONTROL OF FUSARIUM WILT OF TOMATO

TAZEEM AKHTAR1, QAIser SHAKEEL2, GHULAM SARWAR3, SHER MUHAMMAD4, YASIR IFTIKHAR5, M. IRFAN ULLAH6, MUSTANSAR MUBEEN2 AND ABDUL HANNAN7

1Department of Plant Pathology, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad, Pakistan, 38000; 5State Key Laboratory of Agricultural Microbiology and Key Laboratory of Plant Pathology of Hubei Province, Huazhong Agricultural University, Wuhan 430070, China; 4Department of Soil & Environmental Sciences, University College of Agriculture, University of Sargodha, Sargodha, Pakistan; 4National Agriculture Research Centre, Islamabad, Pakistan; 3Department of Plant Pathology, University College of Agriculture, University of Sargodha, Sargodha, Pakistan; 4Department of Entomology, University College of Agriculture, University of Sargodha, Sargodha, Pakistan, 40100; 3Department of Botany, Ghazi University, D.G Khan, Pakistan, 32200.

*Corresponding author’s e-mail: qaisershakeel@outlook.com

Abstract

Fusarium wilt is highly destructive soil borne pathogen in tomato. Current study was carried out to evaluate commercially available fungicides and bio-fungicides in vitro and in vivo, for their efficacy against Fusarium oxysporum f.sp. lycopersici. Firstly four fungicides were evaluated under laboratory conditions. Three promising fungicides, two biopesticides and Trichoderma harzianum were further applied both in greenhouse and field experiments. During in vitro studies PDA amended with fungicides with different treatments @ 1% almost completely inhibited the growth of Fol with varying degree of success whereas Nativo being the most effective treatment with 98% reduction in growth as compared to control. Nativo significantly reduced the disease incidence (32.75 %) at concentration of 1%. While Poly-beta-hydroxyl-butyric acid effectively promoted the tomato growth. Maximum reduction in disease (30.14 %) was expressed by Nativo followed by Teagro (25.06 %) under field conditions. Nativo was found to be the most effective fungicide for management of Fol both In vitro and In vivo. Further field evaluations of the fungicides are required.

Key words: Fusarium oxysporum f.sp. lycopersici, Pathogenicity, Antagonism, Efficacy, Tomato.

Introduction

Tomato (Lycopersicon esculentum Mill.) is an important highly nutritive Solanaceous crop. It is believed to be originated in west coast of South America and being cultivated all over the world (Rice et al., 1987; Smith, 1994; Reis et al., 2005). In Pakistan, annual production of tomato is 599.7 thousand tons with total cultivated area of 63.2 thousand hectares (Anon, 2015). Tomato crop is threatened to many biotic and abiotic factors resulting in yield losses. Around the world, 25% reduction in tomato production have been reported due to Fusarium wilt (Fusarium oxysporum f.sp lycopersici Sacc.) W.C. Snyder & H. N. Hans) (Fol). Fol is one of the severe problems in tomato around the world (Favel et al., 2005; Walker, 1971). In Pakistan, 49.5% yield reduction due to Fol have been reported by FAO, 2015. According to Armstrong and Armstrong, 1981, yellowing, lower leaves drooping, vascular system browning and dark brown streaks of stem are the characteristic symptoms used for identification of this disease. The stem discoloration is sometimes also very prominent in petiole scar.

Several management strategies such as biological control, crop rotation, sanitation and judicious use of fungicides have been reported to manage the Fusarium wilt (Sahat et al, 2013). Resistance can be important for vegetables due to self-protection by resistance genes that impart tolerance to disease (Amini & Sidovich, 2010). Although use of cultivars with genes carrying moderate to high resistance significantly resulting in decreases in pathogen population levels in rhizosphere but different fungicides and biological control agents have been regarded as quick control measure. In recent past the Fusarium wilt has already been controlled at low doses of suitable fungicides (Kumar et al., 2001). Different biocontrol agents compete with fungal pathogens for space and nutrition and perform activities antagonistic to pathogens. Another way of biocontrol activity is through production of certain chemical toxic to pathogen and antixodes which will inhibit the growth and development of fungal pathogens (Agrios, 2005).

Current study was carried out for evaluation of biopesticides and fungicides with the objectives; to find an environment friendly management technique and to compare the efficacy of biocontrol agent, biopesticides and fungicides for the management of Fol disease of tomato both In vitro and In vivo.

Materials and Methods

Collection of samples, cultural media and chemical used: By using the methods described by Amini & Sidovich (2010), plants with characteristics symptoms of Fol were collected from field and stored in refrigerator. Potato dextrose agar (PDA) was used to culture fungi. Teagro (bacterial based biofungicides/ bactericide), Nativo, Antracol, Cordate and Ridomil Gold and Trichoderma harzianum ANR-1 were used to check their efficacy against Fol. Teagro was obtained from novozyme Inc. USA. Nativo, Antracol, Cordate and Ridomil Gold were purchased from local market. The active ingredients and their recommended doses are summarized in Table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr.#</th>
<th>Treatments</th>
<th>Active ingredients</th>
<th>Recommended Doses/acre</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>T1</td>
<td>Nativo 75% WG</td>
<td>Tebuconazole +</td>
<td>65g</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T2</td>
<td>Cordate 4WP</td>
<td>Trifloxystrobin</td>
<td>300g</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T3</td>
<td>Ridomil Gold 68WP</td>
<td>Metalaxil + Mancobe</td>
<td>3.5kg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T4</td>
<td>Antracol 70WP</td>
<td>Propineb</td>
<td>500g</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. Fungicides and their active ingredients.
Sample preparation for identification of Fol: 3-mm roots and stem samples were surface sterilized with 1% NaOCl for 2 min. with two alternative washing in ddH₂O. Then samples were blotted dry and shifted onto PDA plates. Plates were incubated at 27± 2°C for 7 days. After sub-culturing, *Fusarium* isolated were purified by single spore technique. Two media (Carnation Leaf Agar (CLA) and PDA) were used for the morphological identification of *Fusarium* species. The description of species was based on the observation of Nelson *et al.* (1983) and on characteristic described in *Fusarium* Laboratory Manual (Leslie & Summerell, 2006).

**Organic matter:** Soil sample was mixed with 10 mL 1.0 N K₂Cr₂O₇ and 20 mL conc. H₂SO₄ solution for 30 min. After that 200 mL of ddH₂O and 10 mL of H₂PO₄ was added and allowed to cool. 10 to 15 drops of C₆H₅N indicator were added in it and placed on magnetic stirrer bar. The solution was titrated against 0.5 M (NH₄)₂Fe(SO₄)₄·6H₂O solution until the color changed from violet-blue to green (Walkley, 1974). In pots 0.76% organic matter was calculated.

**Pathogenicity test:** For pathogenicity test protocol described by Rajput *et al.* (2008) and Khanzada *et al.* (2004) was followed with little modifications. Briefly, 20 mL of spore suspension of 7 days old *Fusarium* spp. @ 1 x 10⁷ spores/mL was sprayed on surface sterilized roots and stem of tomato. Plants sprayed with 20 mL ddH₂O served as control. There were 5 replications and experiment was repeated 3 times with completely randomized design (CRD). The plant were kept at 27±2°C in growth chamber until disease symptoms appeared. Then re-isolation on PDA was done to confirm the association of Fol with wilt of tomato. Disease rating was based on a scale of 0-5 as described by Benyon *et al.* (1996).

In *vivo* evaluation of fungicides against Fol: Systemic and non-systemic fungicides viz., Nativo, Antracol, Cordate and Ridomil Gold were evaluated for their efficacy on mycelial growth of Fol by food poisoning technique (Grover & Moore, 1962). For this PDA plates amended by different concentration of each fungicide were prepared. The concentration used were 250 µg/L, 500 µg/L and 750 µg/L. After the plates were solidified, 5 mm diameter mycelial discs from 10-days-old culture were aseptically placed in the center of plates. Plate amended by ddH₂O served as control. There were 5 replications with 3 repeats. After incubation at 27 ± 2°C for 7 days, colony diameter was measured. The percent inhibition in growth was calculated by using following formula:

\[ \text{Mycelial growth inhibition (\%) = [(dc-dt)/ dc] \times 100(\%)} \]

where dc and dt represents the average diameter of fungal colony in control and treated, respectively.

Evaluation of fungicides, bactericide and biocontrol agent against Fol of tomato under greenhouse conditions: Three fungicides (Nativo, Antracol, Cordate), two biopesticides (Teagro and Poly-beta-hydroxy-butyric acid (PBHBA)) and *T. harzianum* ANR-1 (Purchased from Ayyub Agricultural Research Institute, Faisalabad, Punjab, Pakistan) were used for *In vitro* study. Pots experiment was performed under greenhouse condition. Sterilized soil containing 0.76% organic matter was used in pots. Teagro is standardized at 10⁹ CFU/g and recommended for controlling the soil borne pathogens. Nativo, Antracol and Cordate were also used against Fol. The concentrations used for each treatment was 1%. Soil drenching technique was used three times with the intervals of 7 days. Disease incidence was recorded three times after 7, 14 and 21 days of interval. Plants without antagonism was served as control. Data was recorded before each application and subjected to statistical analysis.

In *vivo* evaluation of bactericide and fungicides for the management of Fol: Three different fungicides (Nativo, Antracol and Cordate) and bactericide (Teagro) were used against Fol. Meanwhile, the wheat straw after proper washing and draining was inoculated with Fol @ 1 x 10⁷ spores/mL. When Fol completely covered the wheat straw, it was evenly distributed in field (Temperature 26±3°C). Tomato seedlings of 30 days old were transplanted after the establishment of pathogen. After 20 days of transplantation, the concentrations prepared for each treatment based of pervious greenhouse experiment were 0.25, 0.75 and 1.25%. The chemicals were properly mixed with water in tubs. Three times soil drenching was done after 7, 14 and 21 days of interval. Plants without antagonism was served as control. Disease incidence and plant height were recorded before each application and subjected to statistical analysis.

**Statistical analysis:** Analysis of variance (ANOVA) was used to analyze the data in the SAS software (version 8.0.) Mean separations were performed by Least Significant Difference test (LSD). Differences at $P = 0.05$ were considered as significant.

**Results and Discussion**

**Fungal identification:** *F. oxysporum* colonies were observed that shows reddish purple color surrounded by pinkish white aerial mycelium. Under microscope, mycelium looked like sickle shape, crescent moon shape, both ends are pointed and there 3 to 4 septations. So it was confirmed that the isolated fungi was Fol (Fig. 1).

**Pathogenicity test:** After one month of inoculation, plants inoculated with Fol showed typical symptoms of the disease, whereas, no such symptoms were observed on plants without Fol. Non-inoculated plants showed no wilting. Plants inoculated with Fol showed wilting. In control plants, no vascular browning was observed, whereas in plants inoculated with Fol browning of vascular tissues was prominent. Similarly, wilting and death of leaves at the branch apices was only observed where plants were inoculated with Fol.

From pathogenicity test, it is confirmed that Fol was commonly isolated from roots and rotten stem of tomatoes which confirm the association of Fol to stem and root rot of tomato. Highest disease rating of Fol was found on stem and roots. From the results it is confirmed that *Fusarium* species are pathogens of tomatoes. *F. oxysporum, F. solani* and *F. proliferatum* three *Fusarium* species have been reported in various countries that are pathogenic to several crops and these species are also associated with root rot of *Cymbidium* orchid and root rot.
of moth orchid (Phalaenopsis sp. in Australia (Lee et al., 2002; Benyon et al., 1996; Kim et al., 2002). Yellow spot disease in Cymbidium was also reported in Japan by another specie F. proliferatum (Ichikawa & Aoki, 2000). In Korea, leaf spot was caused by Cymbidium hybrid (Kim et al., 2002). Burnett, 1975 reported the F. solani as root pathogen on orchids.

**In vitro evaluation of fungicides against Fol:** Four different fungicides viz., Nativo, Antracol, Cordate and Ridomil Gold were evaluated against Fol by food poison technique. Three concentrations viz., 250, 500 and 750 ppm were prepared for each treatment. Among all Nativo was most effective to reduce the mycelial growth, followed by Ridomil Gold and Antracol whereas Cordate was least effective (Fig. 2). Results revealed that the effect of fungicides in reducing mycelial growth varied but increased after increasing dose rate. The Nativo showed relatively better results (0.53cm) in reduction of mycelial growth at 750ppm over control followed by Ridomil Gold, Antracol and Cordate (1.44cm, 2.37cm and 2.73cm respectively) as compared to control (3.43cm) at 750ppm (Fig. 2). Similar results were obtained in case of effect of incubation period on reduction of mycelial growth (Fig. 3). Again Nativo was found best in reducing the mycelial growth as compared to other fungicides and control.Banyal et al. (2008); Patel et al. (2005); Singh et al. (1997); Kalra & Sokhi (1985); Daradhiyar (1980) and Sommer (1982) reported the similar finding on other fungi. Mycelial growth F. oxysporium was completely inhibited by fungicides (Sharma & Jain, 2006; Khan et al., 2004). Aroosa et al. (2012) also reported that nativo with tibuconazole as active ingredient was most effective as compared to all other fungicides.

**Evaluation of biopesticides and commercially available chemicals against Fol of tomato under greenhouse conditions:** Pots was filled with infested soil then 30 days old seedlings were transplanted. Plants were irrigated when needed. After three weeks of transplantation soil drenching was done. In this experiment different treatments were Nativo, Antracol, Cordate and Teagro were used against Fol. Results of current study are summarized in Figs. 4 and 5. Results showed that Teagro significantly (P = 0.05) reduced the disease among all treatments with disease severity after 1st, 2nd and 3rd application of 42.06%, 30.01% and 23.07% respectively (Fig. 4). In this regard, Saleh (1997) proved that B. subtilis has great potential to inhibit the rhizospheric microbes and it has antagonistic effect against the pathogenic fungi. Biocontrol is a safe technique for controlling the plant pathogens. However to coop the recent trend in agriculture more work is required. Density
of inoculum of pathogens and incidence of disease can be minimize by using the biocontrol agents for longer duration (Harris et al., 1994; Berger et al., 1996). It was concluded that application of Bacillus subtilis showed relatively better results as compared to fungicides in field trials especially. Maximum plant height was observed by PBHBA (21.0cm, 23.66cm and 30.33cm) after 1st, 2nd and 3rd application (Fig. 5). Bio-agents also act as growth promoters such as enhance the plant height and play a good role in minimizing the disease (Sundaramoorthy & Balabaskar, 2014). Significant effect on tomato plant height (25.0 cm) was observed when they were treated with T. harzianum ANR-1 isolate (Fig. 5).

Results indicated that after 1st, 2nd and 3rd application of Nativo exhibited minimum disease incidence at 1.25% concentration (15.13%, 12.27% and 11.09%) (Figs. 6, 7 and 8). By using the biopesticides against Fusarium spp. and against seventeen other different fungi, similar results were observed by Bowers and Locke (2000) and Misra & Dixit (1976). Extracts of garlic bulbs and Bignonia leaves have antifungal activity against various plant pathogenic species like F. pallidoroseum, as they can efficiently inhibit the mycelial growth (Sivaprakasan & Jacob, 1994; Arya et al., 1995). Similar results of plant extracts against other plants pathogenic fungi were observed by Anwar & Khan (2001); Karade & Sawant (1999) and Datar (1999). Our results are similar with Tequida et al. (2002); Bhat (2002); Bansal & Gupta (2000) and Bashir (2001).

Management of Fusarium wilt of tomato through biopesticides and commercially available chemicals in-vivo conditions: Land was prepared and 30 days old seedling was transplanted in field. Nativo was most effective under laboratory followed by Cordate, Antracol and Teagro hence further evaluated through soil drenching in field. Three doses (0.25, 0.5% and 1%) was prepared of each treatment and drenched in soil. Soil drenching was done three times and data was recorded after 7, 14 and 21 days. Significant inhibition in the spore germination was observed by different concentrations of fungicides and biopesticides shown in results (Figs. 6, 7, and 8). After third soil drenching maximum inhibition in the spore germination was found at highest concentration as compared to control which showed least inhibition in spore germination. Significant effect on tomato plant height (25.0 cm) was observed when they were treated with T. harzianum ANR-1 isolate (Fig. 5).
Fig. 8. Drenching-2. Effect of different treatments at different concentration applied through soil drenching after 21 days on disease incidence of *Fol* on tomato under field conditions.

**Conclusion**

It was concluded that inhibition in mycelial growth and spore germination of *F. oxysporum* was observed by the application of both fungicides and biopesticides. However, fungicides used in this study prove to be better substitute to control the pathogenic *Fol* both *in vitro* and *in vivo* conditions and also for inhibit the spore germination. In conclusion, *Fusarium* wilt of tomato caused by *F. oxysporum* *f.sp. lycopersici* was effectively managed by Nativo and Teagro. Further field evaluation is required.

**Acknowledgements**

We are thankful to Department of Plant pathology, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad, Punjab, Pakistan for financial and intellectual input in this work. Kind appreciations are due to Ayyub Agricultural Research Institute, Faisalabad, Punjab, Pakistan for providing us *Trichoderma harzianum* ANR-1.

**References**


FAOSTAT Database. 2015. Food and Agriculture Organization of United Nations.


(Received for publication 22 February 2016)